

# Predicate Logic: Semantics

Alice Gao  
Lecture 13

Based on work by J. Buss, L. Kari, A. Lubiw, B. Bonakdarpour, D. Maftuleac, C. Roberts, R. Treffer, and P. Van Beek

# Outline

## Semantics of Predicate Logic

- The Learning Goals

- Terms and Formulas without Variables

- Terms and Formulas w/o Bound Variables

- Quantified Formulas

- Review Questions

- Valid, Satisfiable, and Unsatisfiable

- Revisiting the Learning Goals

## Learning goals

By the end of this lecture, you should be able to:

- ▶ Define interpretation.
- ▶ Define environment.
- ▶ Determine the truth value of a formula given an interpretation and an environment.
- ▶ Give an interpretation and an environment that make a formula true.
- ▶ Given an interpretation and an environment that make a formula false.
- ▶ Determine and justify whether a formula is valid, satisfiable, and/or unsatisfiable.

# The Language of Predicate Logic

- ▶ Domain: a non-empty set of objects
- ▶ Constants: concrete objects in the domain
- ▶ Functions: takes objects in the domain as arguments and returns an object of the domain.
- ▶ Predicates: takes objects in the domain as arguments and returns true or false. They describe properties of objects or relationships between objects.
- ▶ Variables: placeholders for concrete objects in the domain
- ▶ Quantifiers: for how many objects in the domain is the statement true?

# The semantics of a predicate formula

Given a well-formed formula of predicate logic, does the formula evaluate to F or T in some context?

Example: What does  $(P(a) \vee Q(a, b))$  mean?

The symbols  $P$ ,  $Q$ ,  $a$ , and  $b$  do not have intrinsic meanings.

In **propositional logic**, a **truth valuation** is enough to assign a meaning to a formula.

In **predicate logic**, we need an **interpretation**, and possibly an **environment**.

# Our language of predicate logic

Our language of predicate logic: Constant symbols:  $a, b, c$ .

Variable symbols:  $x, y, z$ . Function symbols:  $f^{(1)}, g^{(2)}$ . Predicate symbols:  $P^{(1)}, Q^{(2)}$ .

Terms without variables:  $a, f(a)$ .

Formulas without variables:  $P(a), Q(a, b), (\neg P(a)), (P(a) \vee Q(a, b))$ .

Terms with variables:  $x, f(x)$ .

Formulas with variables:  $P(x), Q(x, b), (\neg P(x)), (P(x) \vee Q(x, b)), (\forall x P(x)), (\exists x Q(x, b)), (\forall x (\neg P(x))), (\exists x (P(x) \vee Q(x, b))), (\forall y (\exists x Q(x, y)))$ .

# Terms and formulas without variables

Consider a term or a formula that contains only **constant, function, and predicate** symbols.

Terms without variables:

$a, f(a), f(f(a)), g(a, b), g(a, f(b))$ .

Formulas without variables:

$P(a), Q(a, b), (\neg P(a)), (P(a) \vee Q(a, b)), P(g(a, b)),$   
 $Q(a, f(f(a))), (\neg P(f(b))), (P(f(b)) \vee Q(g(a, b), f(c)))$ .

# The semantics of terms/formulas without variables

Interpreting terms/formulas without variables requires an **interpretation**, which contains the following components:

- ▶ Domain
- ▶ A meaning for each constant symbol
- ▶ A meaning for each function symbol
- ▶ A meaning for each predicate symbol



## An example of an interpretation

Our language of predicate logic: Constant symbols:  $a, b, c$ .

Variable symbols:  $x, y, z$ . Function symbols:  $f^{(1)}, g^{(2)}$ . Predicate symbols:  $P^{(1)}, Q^{(2)}$ .

Interpretation I:

▶ Domain:  $\text{dom}(I)$  is the set of integers.

▶ Constants:  $a^I = 1, b^I = 2, c^I = 3$ .

▶ Functions:

$$f^I: f^I(x) = x + 1.$$

$$g^I: g^I(x, y) = x + y.$$

▶ Predicates:

$P^I$ :  $P^I(x)$  is true if and only if  $x > 5$ .

$Q^I$ :  $Q^I(x, y)$  is true if and only if  $x > y$ .

# Evaluating terms and formulas without variables

Evaluate these terms and formulas under  $I$ .

$f(f(a))$ ,  $g(a, f(b))$ ,  $Q(a, f(f(a)))$ ,  $(P(a) \vee Q(a, b))$ .

Interpretation  $I$ :

▶ Domain:  $\text{dom}(I)$  is the set of integers.

▶ Constants:  $a^I = 1$ ,  $b^I = 2$ ,  $c^I = 3$ .

▶ Functions:

$$f^I: f^I(x) = x + 1.$$

$$g^I: g^I(x, y) = x + y.$$

▶ Predicates:

$P^I$ :  $P^I(x)$  is true if and only if  $x > 5$ .

$Q^I$ :  $Q^I(x, y)$  is true if and only if  $x > y$ .

## A function must be total

A function symbol  $f^{(k)}$  must be interpreted as a function  $f^I$  that is total on the domain  $D$ .

$$f^{(k)} : D \times D \rightarrow D$$

- ▶ Any  $k$ -tuple  $(d_1, \dots, d_k)$  in  $D^k$  can be an input to  $f^{(k)}$ .
- ▶ For any legal  $k$ -tuple,  $f^I(d_1, \dots, d_k)$  must be in  $D$ .

## CQ A function must be total

Which of the following functions is total?

- (A)  $g^{\mathbb{I}}(x, y) = x - y$ . The domain is the set of natural numbers.
- (B)  $f^{\mathbb{I}}(x) = \sqrt{x}$ . The domain is the set of integers.
- (C)  $f^{\mathbb{I}}(x) = x + 1$ . The domain is  $\{1, 2, 3\}$ .
- (D)  $f^{\mathbb{I}}(1) = 2$ ,  $f^{\mathbb{I}}(2) = 3$  and  $f^{\mathbb{I}}(3) = 3$ . The domain is  $\{1, 2, 3\}$ .
- (E)  $g^{\mathbb{I}}(x, y) = x > y$ . The domain is the set of integers.

# Notation for functions and predicates

## Functions:

- ▶  $g^I$  is the addition function.  $g^I(x, y) = x + y$ .
- ▶  $f^I(1) = 2$ ,  $f^I(2) = 3$  and  $f^I(3) = 3$ .

## Predicates:

- ▶  $Q^I$ :  $Q^I(x, y)$  is true if and only if  $x > y$ .
- ▶  $Q^I = \{\langle 2, 1 \rangle, \langle 3, 1 \rangle, \langle 3, 2 \rangle\}$

## Give an interpretation that makes the formula true/false

Our language of predicate logic: Constant symbols:  $a, b, c$ .

Variable symbols:  $x, y, z$ . Function symbols:  $f^{(1)}, g^{(2)}$ . Predicate symbols:  $P^{(1)}, Q^{(2)}$ .

Complete  $I$  such that

(A)  $Q(a, f(f(a)))^I = T$  or  $I \models Q(a, f(f(a)))$

(B)  $Q(a, f(f(a)))^I = F$  or  $I \not\models Q(a, f(f(a)))$

Interpretation  $I$ :

- ▶ Domain:  $\text{dom}(I) = \{1, 2, 3\}$ .
- ▶ Constants:  $a^I = ?$ ,  $b^I = ?$ ,  $c^I = ?$ .
- ▶ Functions:  $f^I : ?$ ,  $g^I : ?$
- ▶ Predicates:  $P^I : ?$ ,  $Q^I : ?$

# Terms and formulas w/o bound variables

Terms w/o bound variables:

$f(f(x))$ ,  $g(x, f(b))$ .

Formulas w/o bound variables:

$Q(a, f(f(x)))$ ,  $(P(f(y)) \vee Q(g(x, y), f(a)))$ .

Interpreting terms/formulas with free variables requires an environment.

# Environment

An environment is a function, which maps every variable symbol to a domain element.

Our language of predicate logic: Constant symbols:  $a, b, c$ .

Variable symbols:  $x, y, z$ . Function symbols:  $f^{(1)}, g^{(2)}$ . Predicate symbols:  $P^{(1)}, Q^{(2)}$ .

Let  $\text{dom}(I) = \{1, 2, 3\}$ .

An example of an environment for our language:

$E(x) = 1, E(y) = 2, E(z) = 2$ .



# Evaluating terms and formulas w/o bound variables

Evaluate these terms and formulas under  $I$  and  $E$ .

$f(f(x))$ ,  $g(x, f(b))$ ,  $Q(a, f(f(x)))$ ,  $(P(f(y)) \vee Q(g(x, y), f(a)))$ .

Environment  $E$ :  $E(x) = 3$ ,  $E(y) = 2$ ,  $E(z) = 1$ .

Interpretation  $I$ :

▶ Domain:  $\text{dom}(I)$  is the set of integers.

▶ Constants:  $a^I = 1$ ,  $b^I = 2$ ,  $c^I = 3$ .

▶ Functions:

$f^I$ :  $f^I(x) = x + 1$ .

$g^I$ :  $g^I(x, y) = x + y$ .

▶ Predicates:

$P^I$ :  $P^I(x)$  is true if and only if  $x > 5$ .

$Q^I$ :  $Q^I(x, y)$  is true if and only if  $x > y$ .

## Give $(I, E)$ that makes the formula true/false

Our language of predicate logic: Constant symbols:  $a, b, c$ .

Variable symbols:  $x, y, z$ . Function symbols:  $f^{(1)}, g^{(2)}$ . Predicate symbols:  $P^{(1)}, Q^{(2)}$ .

Complete  $I$  and  $E$  such that

$$(A) \quad Q(a, f(f(x)))^{(I, E)} = T \text{ or } I \models_E Q(a, f(f(x)))$$

$$(B) \quad Q(a, f(f(x)))^{(I, E)} = F \text{ or } I \not\models_E Q(a, f(f(x)))$$

Interpretation  $I$ :

- ▶ Domain:  $\text{dom}(I) = \{1, 2, 3\}$ .
- ▶ Constants:  $a^I = ?$ ,  $b^I = ?$ ,  $c^I = ?$ .
- ▶ Functions:  $f^I : ?$ ,  $g^I : ?$
- ▶ Predicates:  $P^I : ?$ ,  $Q^I : ?$

## Important notes about an environment

- ▶ An environment has to map **every** variable symbol to a domain element, even if the variable **does not appear** in a formula.
- ▶ Bound variables get their meanings through the quantifiers. Free variables get their meanings through an environment.

If a formula does not have any free variable, an interpretation is sufficient to give the formula meaning. There is no need to define an environment.

# Formulas with quantifiers

The meanings of quantified formulas:

- ▶  $(\forall x \alpha)$ :  $\alpha$  is true for every possible value of  $x$  in the domain.

$(\forall x \alpha)^{(I, E)} = \top$  if  $\alpha^{(I, E[x \mapsto d])} = \top$  for every  $d \in \text{dom}(I)$ .

- ▶  $(\exists x \alpha)$ :  $\alpha$  is true for at least one value of  $x$  in the domain.

$(\exists x \alpha)^{(I, E)} = \top$  if  $\alpha^{(I, E[x \mapsto d])} = \top$  for at least one  $d \in \text{dom}(I)$ .

$E[x \mapsto d]$  is making a small change to the environment  $E$ .

## The environment override/reassignment notation

$E[x \mapsto d]$  keeps all the mappings in  $E$  intact  
EXCEPT reassigning  $x$  to  $d \in \text{dom}(I)$ .

Suppose that  $E(x) = 3$ ,  $E(y) = 3$ ,  $E(z) = 1$ .  $\text{dom}(I) = \{1, 2, 3\}$ .

1.  $E[x \mapsto 2](x) = ?$
2.  $E[x \mapsto 2](y) = ?$
3.  $E[x \mapsto 2](z) = ?$
4.  $E[x \mapsto 2][y \mapsto 1](x) = ?$
5.  $E[x \mapsto 2][y \mapsto 1](y) = ?$
6.  $E[x \mapsto 2][y \mapsto 1](z) = ?$

## Evaluate formulas under (I, E)

Our language of predicate logic: Constant symbols:  $a, b, c$ .

Variable symbols:  $x, y, z$ . Function symbols:  $f^{(1)}, g^{(2)}$ . Predicate symbols:  $P^{(1)}, Q^{(2)}$ .

Evaluate these terms and formulas under I and E.

(A)  $(\forall x (\exists y Q(x, y)))$

(B)  $(\exists x (\forall y Q(x, y)))$

Interpretation I:

- ▶ Domain:  $\text{dom}(I) = \{1, 2, 3\}$ .
- ▶ Predicates:  $Q^I = \{\langle 1, 2 \rangle, \langle 3, 1 \rangle, \langle 2, 3 \rangle\}$ .

## Give (I, E) that makes the formula true/false

Our language of predicate logic: Constant symbols:  $a, b, c$ .

Variable symbols:  $x, y, z$ . Function symbols:  $f^{(1)}, g^{(2)}$ . Predicate symbols:  $P^{(1)}, Q^{(2)}$ .

Complete I and E such that the following formula is true/false.

(A)  $(\forall y (\exists x Q(x, y)))$

(B)  $(\exists y (\forall x Q(x, y)))$

Interpretation I:

▶ Domain:  $\text{dom}(I) = \{1, 2, 3\}$ .

▶ ...

## CQ Review Question 1

Our language of predicate logic: Constant symbols:  $a, b, c$ .

Variable symbols:  $x, y, z$ . Function symbols:  $f^{(1)}, g^{(2)}$ . Predicate symbols:  $P^{(1)}, Q^{(2)}$ .

We want to show that the following predicate formula is satisfiable.  
What do we need to do?

$$Q(f(x), g(b, y))$$

- (A) Define an interpretation only.
- (B) Define an environment only.
- (C) Define an interpretation and an environment.



## CQ Review Question 2

Our language of predicate logic: Constant symbols:  $a, b, c$ .

Variable symbols:  $x, y, z$ . Function symbols:  $f^{(1)}, g^{(2)}$ . Predicate symbols:  $P^{(1)}, Q^{(2)}$ .

We want to show that the following predicate formula is satisfiable.  
What do we need to do?

$$(\forall x Q(f(x), g(b, y)))$$

- (A) Define an interpretation only.
- (B) Define an environment only.
- (C) Define an interpretation and an environment.

## CQ Review Question 3

Our language of predicate logic: Constant symbols:  $a, b, c$ .

Variable symbols:  $x, y, z$ . Function symbols:  $f^{(1)}, g^{(2)}$ . Predicate symbols:  $P^{(1)}, Q^{(2)}$ .

We want to show that the following predicate formula is satisfiable.  
What do we need to do?

$$(\exists y (\forall x Q(f(x), g(b, y))))$$

- (A) Define an interpretation only.
- (B) Define an environment only.
- (C) Define an interpretation and an environment.

## Notation for Evaluating a Term

Consider the interpretation  $I$  below.

- ▶  $\text{dom}(I) = \{1, 2, 3\}$ .
- ▶  $a^I = 2, b^I = 1, c^I = 1$ .
- ▶  $f^I(x) = x, \forall x \in \text{dom}(I), g^I(x) = 1, \forall x \in \text{dom}(I)$ .
- ▶  $Q^I = \{\langle 1, 2 \rangle\}, P^I = \emptyset$ .

Let the environment  $E$  be  $E(x) = 1, E(y) = 2, E(z) = 3$ .

What is  $g(a, x)^I$ ?

$$g(a, x)^{(I, E)} = g^I(a^I, E(x)) = g^I(2, 1) = 1 \quad (1)$$

## Notation for Evaluating a Formula

Consider the interpretation  $I$  below.

- ▶  $\text{dom}(I) = \{1, 2, 3\}$ .
- ▶  $a^I = 2, b^I = 1, c^I = 1$ .
- ▶  $f^I(x) = x, \forall x \in \text{dom}(I), g^I(x) = 1, \forall x \in \text{dom}(I)$ .
- ▶  $Q^I = \{\langle 1, 2 \rangle\}, P^I = \emptyset$ .

Let the environment  $E$  be  $E(x) = 1, E(y) = 2, E(z) = 3$ .

$Q(x, y)^{(I, E[y \mapsto 2])} = T$  because all of the following hold:

$$E[y \mapsto 2](x) = 1 \tag{2}$$

$$E[y \mapsto 2](y) = 2 \tag{3}$$

$$\langle E[y \mapsto 2](x), E[y \mapsto 2](y) \rangle = \langle 1, 2 \rangle \in Q^I \tag{4}$$

# Valid, Satisfiable, Unsatisfiable

A formula  $\alpha$  is a **valid**:

$I \models_E \alpha$  for every interpretation  $I$  and environment  $E$ .

A formula  $\alpha$  is **unsatisfiable**:

$I \not\models_E \alpha$  for every interpretation  $I$  and environment  $E$ .

A formula  $\alpha$  is **satisfiable**:

$I \models_E \alpha$  for some interpretation  $I$  and environment  $E$ .

Most predicate formulas are satisfiable but not valid because we have a great deal of freedom to choose  $I$  and  $E$ .

## Proving that a formula is valid/not valid

Consider the predicate formula  $((\forall x P(x)) \rightarrow (\exists x P(x)))$ .

- ▶ Determine whether the formula is valid or not.
- ▶ How do I prove that this formula is NOT valid?
- ▶ How do I prove that this formula is valid?

## Revisiting the learning goals

By the end of this lecture, you should be able to:

- ▶ Define interpretation.
- ▶ Define environment.
- ▶ Determine the truth value of a formula given an interpretation and an environment.
- ▶ Give an interpretation and an environment that make a formula true.
- ▶ Given an interpretation and an environment that make a formula false.
- ▶ Determine and justify whether a formula is valid, satisfiable, and/or unsatisfiable.