

This is an example in which we use propositional logic to model real world arguments.

Consider the following argument, drawn from an article by Julian Baggini. The onnagata are male actors portraying female characters in kabuki theatre.

Premise 1: If women are too close to femininity to portray women, then men must be too close to masculinity to play men, and vice versa.

Premise 2: And yet, if the onnagata are correct, women are too close to femininity to portray women and yet men are not too close to masculinity to play men.

Conclusion: Therefore, the onnagata are incorrect, and women are not too close to femininity to portray women.

Translate the two premises and the conclusion into propositional logic.

Think about this argument. Do you believe it is valid? Why or why not? We will talk about how to prove or disprove the validity of an argument in 2 weeks.

Relevant articles:

<http://www.butterfliesandwheels.org/2004/tu-quoque/>

<https://www.theguardian.com/stage/2004/aug/21/theatre>