

# A Note on the Covering Numbers $g(1,3;v)$

Sherry Judah, R.C. Mullin and D.R. Stinson

## ABSTRACT

An exact  $(1,3)$ -cover of order  $v$  is a family  $C$  of proper subsets of  $v$ -set  $V$ , each of which has cardinality at least 3, with the property that every unordered triple of distinct elements of  $V$  is contained in precisely one member of  $C$ . The number  $g(1,3;v)$  is defined by  $g(1,3;v) = \min\{|C| : C \text{ is a } (1,3)\text{-cover of order } v\}$ . The value of  $g(1,3;v)$  is known for infinitely values of  $v$ , and has been determined for  $4 \leq v \leq 26$  with the exception of  $v \in \{11,13,19,23,24\}$ . Here we show that  $g(1,3;19) = 77$ ,  $125 \leq g(1,3;23) \leq 130$  and  $g(1,3;24) = 130$ .

### 1. Introduction.

Let  $V$  be a  $v$ -set of elements (called points), and let  $C$  be a collection of proper subsets of  $V$  (called blocks). The collection  $C$  is said to be a  $(1,3)$ -cover of order  $v$  if every triple of distinct points occurs in a unique block of  $C$  and every block contains at least three points. The number  $g(1,3;v)$  is defined to be the least number of blocks which can occur in a  $(1,3)$ -cover of order  $v$ , that is,

$$g(1,3;v) = \min\{|C| : C \text{ is a minimum cover of order } v\}$$

A  $(1,3)$ -cover of order  $v$  which contains  $g(1,3;v)$  blocks is said to be *minimal*. R.G. Stanton and J.G. Kalbfleisch [8] determined the value of  $g(1,3;v)$  for  $4 \leq v \leq 10$ , and showed that  $g(1,3;v) = O(v^{3/2})$ . The values of  $g(1,3;v)$  have been determined for an infinite number of values of  $v$  by Hartman, Mullin and Stinson [3]. In addition,  $g(1,3;v)$  has been determined for all  $v$  satisfying  $12 \leq v \leq 26$ , with the exception of  $v \in \{13,19,23,24\}$  (see table 1). It is our purpose here to show that  $g(1,3;19) = 77$ ,  $g(1,3;23) \geq 125$ , and  $g(1,3;24) = 130$ .

### 2. Preliminary results.

A finite linear space  $G$  is a pair  $(P,L)$  where  $P$  is a finite set of objects, called *points*, and  $L$  is a family of subsets of  $P$  called *lines*, which satisfies the following.

- (i) Every pair of distinct points lies in (on) a unique line,
- (ii) Every line contains at least two points, and no line contains all points.

A *near-pencil* is a finite linear space in which some line contains all but one of the points. The following is proved in [2].

**Lemma 2.1.** *Let  $F$  be a finite linear space on  $v \geq 5$  points which is not a near-pencil. If  $b$  denotes the number of lines of  $F$ , then  $b \geq B(v)$ , where*

$$B(v) = \begin{cases} n^2+n+1 & \text{if } n^2+2 \leq v \leq n^2+n+1 \\ n^2+n & \text{if } n^2-n+3 \leq v \leq n^2+1 \\ n^2+n-1 & \text{if } n^2-n+2 = v. \end{cases}$$

An *extended near-pencil* of order  $v$  is a  $(1,3)$ -cover of a  $v$ -set  $v$  in which

some block contains all but one point of  $V$ . Such a cover contains  $1 + \binom{v-1}{2}$  blocks.

Let  $C$  be a  $(1,3)$ -cover of order  $v$ , and let  $x$  be a point of  $C$ . Then the set of blocks

$$C_x = \{B \setminus \{x\} : x \in B, B \in C\}$$

is called the derived design of  $C$  (with respect to  $x$ ). Clearly either  $C_x$  contains just one block (in which case  $C$  is an extended near-pencil), or  $C_x$  is a finite linear space on  $v-1$  points. It is easily shown that if  $C_x$  is a near-pencil on  $v-1$  points, then  $C$  contains at least  $1 + \binom{v-1}{2}$  blocks.

The following lemma on binomial coefficients is observed in [3].

**Lemma 2.2.** Suppose that  $k_1, k_2, \dots, k_b$  are non-negative integers, and

$$\sum_{i=1}^b k_i \geq qb + r,$$

where  $0 \leq r < b$  and  $q \geq 1$ . Then  $\sum_{i=1}^b \binom{k_i}{t} \geq r \binom{q+1}{t} + (b-r) \binom{q}{t}$ ; with equality if and only if precisely  $r$  of the  $k_i$ 's are equal to  $q+1$ , and the remaining  $k_i$ 's are equal to  $q$  (hence  $\sum_{i=1}^b k_i = qb + r$ ).

**Lemma 2.3.** Let  $c$  be any integer satisfying the inequality  $g(1,3;v) \leq c \leq \binom{v-1}{2}$ . Then the inequality

$$v(v-1)(v-2) \geq q(q-1)[3v \cdot B(v-1) - 2c(q+1)],$$

where  $q = \lfloor v \cdot B(v-1) / c \rfloor$  and  $B(\cdot)$  is as in Lemma 2.1, must hold.

**Proof.** Suppose that there is a 3-cover of  $C$  of a set  $V$ , where  $|C| \leq c < \binom{v-1}{2}$ . For  $i = 1, 2, \dots, |C|$ , let  $k_i$  denote the cardinality of the  $i$ th block of  $C$ ; and if  $|C| < c$ , let  $k_i = 0$  for  $|C| + 1 \leq i \leq c$ . Since  $C_x$  cannot be either a single block or a near-pencil for any  $x$  in  $V$ , we have

$$\sum_{i=1}^c k_i \geq vB(v-1) = qc + r,$$

for some  $r$  satisfying  $0 \leq r < c$ . By Lemma 2.2, we have

$$\begin{aligned} v(v-1)(v-2) &= 3! \sum_{i=1}^c \binom{k_i}{3} \\ &\geq r(q+1)q(q-1) + (c-r)q(q-1)(q-2). \end{aligned}$$

Substituting  $r = vB(v-1) - qc$  and simplifying, we obtain the desired result.  $\square$

### 3. Determination of $g(1,3;v)$ , $v = 19, 24$ .

Lemma 2.3 and modifications thereof can be used in the determination of certain covering numbers. This is demonstrated below.

**Lemma 3.1.** The number  $g(1,3;24)$  is 130.

**Proof.** Applying Lemma 2.3 with  $v = 24$  and  $c = 129$  yields a contradic-

tion; therefore  $g(1,3;4) \geq 130$ . But  $g(1,3;25) = 130$  (see [3]), and the result follows.  $\square$

**Lemma 3.2.** *The number  $g(1,3;19)$  is 77.*

**Proof.** It is shown in [9] that  $g(1,3;18) = 76$ ; hence  $g(1,3;19) \geq 76$ . Now suppose that  $C$  is a  $(1,3)$ -cover of 19-set  $V$ , which contains 76 blocks. We first observe that  $C$  can contain at most one block of size (cardinality) 3, and that if some point of  $V$  occurs in at least 22 blocks, then  $C$  cannot contain a block of size 3. Indeed we employ the method of Lemma 2.3, noting that  $B(19) = 21$ . First assume that  $C$  contains at least two blocks of size 3, and let  $k_{75} = k_{76} = 3$ . Then we find that  $\sum_{i=1}^{74} k_i \geq 393 = 5(74) + 24$ ; thus

$$19 \cdot 18 \cdot 17 - 2(3 \cdot 2 \cdot 1) = 5802 \geq \sum_{i=1}^{74} k_i (k_i - 1)(k_i - 2) = 5820;$$

a contradiction. Similarly if  $k_{76} = 3$  and some point has frequency 19, a contradiction is obtained. Now let us assume that  $C$  contains a block  $B$  of size 3. Then all other points occur in precisely 21 blocks. Thus the derived designs  $C_x$ ,  $x \in V$  can all be embedded in  $\pi$ , the projective plane of order 4 (see [2]). Thus, any  $C_x$  can be obtained from  $\pi$  either by deleting either three collinear points, or a "triangle" of 3 non-collinear points. If  $x$  is in  $B$ , it follows that  $B_x$  contains one line of length 2, twelve lines of length 4 and eight lines of length 5. If  $x$  is not in  $B$ , then  $B_x$  contains three lines of length 3, nine lines of length 4 and nine lines of length 5. Since there are three points in  $B$  and sixteen points not in  $B$ , we find that the number of blocks in  $C$  is

$$|C| = 3 \cdot 1/3 + 16 \cdot 3/4 + (3 \cdot 12 + 16 \cdot 9)/5 + (3 \cdot 8 + 16 \cdot 9)/6$$

which is 77, a contradiction. So  $C$  contains no block of size 3. By Lemma 2.4, if  $C$  contains a block of size  $k \geq 7$ , then  $|C| > 76$ , so  $C$  contains no such block. Thus  $C$  has only blocks of size 4, 5 and 6. However,  $6 \cdot 5 \cdot 4$ ,  $5 \cdot 4 \cdot 3$  and  $4 \cdot 3 \cdot 2$  are all divisible by 12, whereas  $19 \cdot 18 \cdot 17$  is not so

$$\sum_{i=1}^{76} k_i (k_i - 1)(k_i - 2) = 19 \cdot 18 \cdot 17$$

cannot be satisfied. Thus  $g(1,3;19) \geq 77$ . But by [5],  $g(1,3;20) = 77$ , so  $g(1,3;19) = 77$ .  $\square$

#### 4. A bound for $g(1,3;23)$ .

As shown in the next section,  $g(1,3;v)$  has now been determined for all  $v \leq 26$  with the exception of  $v \in \{11,13,23\}$ . In this section we show that  $g(1,3;23) \geq 125$ . (As in the preceding section, we have  $g(1,3;23) \leq 130$ .) A direct application of Lemma 2.3 yields  $g(1,3;23) \geq 123$ . This is improved below.

**Lemma 4.1.** *Any linear space  $F$  on 22 points which contains exactly 29 lines contains exactly one line of length 6, twelve lines of length 5 and sixteen lines of length 4 (and no other lines). Conversely any finite linear space on 22 points which has line sizes all of which lie in  $\{4,5,6\}$  contains precisely 29 lines.*

**Proof.** See [2] and [1].  $\square$

**Corollary 4.2.** *There is no  $(1,3)$ -cover  $C$  of order 23 all of whose block sizes lie in  $\{5,6,7\}$ .*

**Proof.** Such a cover would contain exactly  $23/7$  blocks of size 7, which is absurd.  $\square$

**Corollary 4.3.** Any (1,3)-cover of order 23 contains at least three points which lie in more than twenty-nine blocks.

**Proof.** Any such cover must contain a block of size 3 or 4, and the derived design of a point in such a block must have at least thirty lines.  $\square$

We refer to the number of blocks of a cover  $C$  which contain a given point  $x$  as the frequency of  $x$ .

**Lemma 4.4.** Any (1,3)-cover of order 23 contains at least 124 blocks.

**Proof.** Using arguments similar to those of Lemma 3.2, it is readily shown that if  $|C| = 123$ , then there can be at most two points of frequency greater than 29 in  $C$ , contradicting Lemma 4.3.  $\square$

**Lemma 4.5.** Any (1,3)-cover of order 23 which contains a block of size  $k \geq 8$  contains at least 130 blocks.

**Proof.** The result follows by applying Lemma 2.4.  $\square$

Note that if  $b_i$  ( $i = 3, 4, \dots, 7$ ) denotes the number of blocks of size  $i$  in a (1,3)-cover of order 23, then the  $b_i$  satisfy the following equations.

$$\begin{aligned} \text{(i)} \quad & \sum_{i=3}^7 b_i = |C|, \\ \text{(ii)} \quad & \sum_{i=3}^7 i b_i = 29 \cdot 23 + e, \\ \text{(iii)} \quad & \sum_{i=3}^7 \binom{i}{3} b_i = \binom{23}{3}, \end{aligned}$$

where  $e$  is the "excess frequency", that is,  $e = \sum_{i=1}^{23} (f_i - 29)$ , where  $f_i$  is the frequency of the  $i$ th point of  $C$ .

**Lemma 4.6.** There is no (1,3)-cover of order 23 which contains exactly 124 blocks.

**Proof.** Assume that such a (1,3)-cover  $C$  exists. As noted in Corollary 4.3,  $C$  contains at least three points of frequency greater than 29, hence in such a cover we have  $e \geq 3$ . If we assume that  $e \geq 6$ , then, bearing in mind that  $C$  must contain a block of size 3 or 4, Lemma 2.2 yields a contradiction, namely that  $\sum_{i=1}^{23} \binom{k_i}{3} > \binom{23}{3}$ , where  $k_i$  is the size of the  $i$ th block of  $C$ . Therefore  $e$  must lie in the range  $3 \leq e \leq 5$ . Thus there are at least 18 points of frequency 29 in  $C$ , and since each lies in a block of size 7, so there must be at least three such blocks in  $C$ . Moreover if  $e = 3$ , then we must have  $b_3 = 1$ ,  $b_4 = 0$ ; if  $e = 4$  then  $b_4 \leq 1$ , and if  $b_4 = 0$ , then  $b_3 > 1$ ; and if  $e = 5$  and  $b_4 = 0$ , then  $b_3 > 1$ . It is readily verified that there is only one such solution to the above equations, namely  $(b_3, b_4, b_5, b_6, b_7, e) = (10, 75, 44, 4, 3)$ . Should a cover  $C$  exist corresponding to this distribution, it must contain exactly 20 points of frequency 29, and each point of  $B$ , the block of size 3 must have frequency exactly 30 in  $C$ . Thus there is a unique point  $x$  of frequency 30 which occurs in exactly one block of size 7 in  $C$ , since each point of frequency 29 occurs in precisely one such block. Note that  $x$  also occurs in  $B$ , the block of size 3 in  $C$ . Let  $c_i$  denote the number of lines of length  $i$  in  $C_x$ , the

derived design of  $C$  with respect to  $x$ . Noting that  $c_2 = c_6 = 1$ , and  $c_3 = 0$ , counting pairs and lines in  $C_x$  yields the equations

$$6c_4 + 10c_5 = 215,$$

$$c_4 + c_5 = 28.$$

Hence  $4c_5 = 47$ , which is clearly impossible. Therefore no such  $C$  exists.

**Corollary 4.7.** *The number  $g(1,3;23)$  is at least 125.*

### 5. Conclusions.

The numbers  $g(1,3;v)$  have now been determined for  $4 \leq v \leq 26$  with the exceptions of  $v \in \{11,13,23\}$ . The values of these numbers are exhibited in table 1 with appropriate references. The remaining cases appear to be very difficult. Indeed, it appears that determining  $g(1,3;11)$  and  $g(1,3;13)$  is beyond the scope of present methods.

Table 1

$v$	$g(1,3;v)$	reference
4	4	[8]
5	7	[8]
6	11	[8]
7	14	[8]
8	14	[8]
9	29	[8]
10	30	[8]
11	$\leq 46$	
12	47	[7]
13	?	
14	63	[5]
15	68	[4]
16	68	[5]
17	68	[5]
18	76	[9]
19	77	§3
20	77	[6]
21	77	[6]
22	77	[8]
23	$\geq 125$	§4
24	130	§3
25	130	[5]
26	130	[5]

### References.

- [1] L.M. Batten, *Linear spaces with line range  $\{n-1, n, n+1\}$  and at most  $n^2$  points*, J. Austral. Math. Soc., Series A, 30 (1980), 215-228.
- [2] P. Erdős, R.C. Mullin, V. Sós, and D.R. Stinson, *Finite linear spaces and projective planes*, Discrete Math. 47 (1983), 49-62.
- [3] A. Hartman, R.C. Mullin, and D.R. Stinson, *Exact covering configurations and Steiner systems*, Journal of London Math. Soc. (2), 25 (1982), 193-200.
- [4] Sherry Judah and R.C. Mullin, *The determination of the exact covering number  $g(1,3;15)$* , Congressus Numerantium 41 (1984), 27-52.

- [5] E.S. Kramer and R.C. Mullin, *The exact covering numbers  $g(1,3;14)$ ,  $g(1,4;15)$  and  $g(1,5;16)$* , *Utilitas Math.* 24 (1983), 253-275.
- [6] R.G. Stanton, J.L. Allston and D.D. Cowan, *Determination of an exact covering by triples*, *Congressus Numerantium* 32 (1981), 253-258.
- [7] R.G. Stanton and P.H. Dirksen, *Computation of  $g(1,3;12)$* , *Combinatorial Math. IV* (eds. L.R.A. Casse & W.D. Wallis), Springer-Verlag (560), Berlin-Heidelberg-New York (1976), 232-239.
- [8] R.G. Stanton and J.G. Kalbfleisch, *The  $\lambda-\mu$  problem:  $\lambda = 1$  and  $\mu = 3$* , *Proc. Second Chapel Hill Conf. on Combinatorics*, Chapel Hill (1972), 451-462.
- [9] D.R. Stinson, *Determination of a covering number*, *Congressus Numerantium* 34 (1982), 429-440.